

A.Zh. Muratova<sup>1</sup>, A.B. Smanova<sup>1</sup>, E.K. Daurembekov<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Kazakhstan, Almaty

<sup>2</sup>L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Kazakhstan, Astana

(e-mail: m-alua@mail.ru, akmaral.smanova@kaznu.edu.kz, e.daurembekov@mail.ru)

---

## Animal cruelty as an indicator of domestic violence

---

**Abstract.** *Animal abuse is a growing public health concern and an early indicator of domestic violence; therefore, this research paper investigates its relationship with domestic abuse.*

*This research seeks to establish and examine the connection between animal cruelty and domestic violence, especially acts perpetrated against domestic pets, and incidents of victim-driven animal husbandry when animals become the targets of aggression in a home environment. We explore psychological, sociocultural, legal and victim-driven animal husbandry aspects as well as instances when domestic animals themselves become the targets for aggression in domestic settings.*

*Study findings reveal an unexpected connection between animal abuse and domestic violence that could help law enforcement agencies, public organizations and professionals working in social support and psychology detect cases sooner. It would also allow victims to receive immediate assistance. This research holds great relevance for law enforcement officials as well as practitioners working within these fields of social support and psychology.*

*Law enforcement, social services and public organizations may utilize the findings from this study to enhance procedures for detecting domestic violence as well as protecting animals from abuse.*

**Keywords:** *animals, abuse, animal protection, violence, animal cruelty, domestic violence, animal rights protection service.*

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32523/2616-6844-2023-144-3-63-70>

---

### Introduction

Animal cruelty and domestic violence continue to draw increasing public scrutiny and cause great public alarm, yet their relationship remains poorly understood and often underestimated.

This study's objective is to highlight the correlation between animal cruelty and domestic violence. Examining this subject matter is highly pertinent as it allows not only for greater insight into violence within family settings, but also warns against negative repercussions for animals who also face this challenge.

This research project investigates instances of animal cruelty and domestic violence as subjects, with particular interest to their relationship between each of the phenomena

studied. Our goal is to understand this relationship better in order to provide more effective preventive and control measures against domestic violence.

To reach this objective, the following tasks were devised: review of existing research on this subject matter; examination of legislation and practice across several nations; as well as conducting an empirical investigation in order to detect specific interrelations among cases.

At an international level, animal rights are acknowledged and recognized. European nations signed the European Convention for the Protection of Pets [1], while many state legislation contains provisions criminalizing acts of cruelty toward animals; Kazakhstan for example provides criminal liability laws under Law No 97-VII "On Responsible Treatment

of Animals". According to this definition of cruelty against animals, any intentional act that causes or threatens death, injury or health damage for an animal [2].

Cruelty to animals is widely recognized as socially dangerous and illegal behavior that deserves punishment. Cruelty involves inhumane treatment of animals for various reasons - hooliganism or selfish gain for example - using violent methods often in front of minors that result in their deaths or injuries.

As A.I. Chuchaev notes, cruel animal treatment includes inflicting pain upon them by withholding water or food supplies or subjecting them to extreme climate conditions; physical injuries caused to them; mistreatment; mistreating their bodies in other cruel ways [3].

Analysis of criminal law literature allows one to draw the inference that animal cruelty in our nation poses a grave problem that must be solved urgently [4].

Studies involving interpersonal violence against animals treat 'cruelty', 'mistreatment', and 'animal cruelty' interchangeably; all three terms refer to social behaviors which purposely cause discomfort to animals [5]; including involuntary harm such as deprivation of food and water supplies, lack of vet care services, organized fights with violent behaviors between participants (be it sexual violence (bestiality), burns caused by weapons or sharp objects as weapons used against their victim and shooting, strangulating, poisoning or killing off animals [6]. Animal cruelty can affect all sorts of creatures alike with dogs being most often victims [7].

Once again, here we go – another year has flown by and yet here I sit pondering how on Earth did they manage it...?? Studies have established a connection between animal cruelty and interpersonal violence, especially domestic or family violence (violent acts between family members or intimate partners occurring at home, but not limited to them) [8], as well as socially perpetrated acts (violent incidents between unrelated people that typically occurs outside the house [9]). Animal cruelty often forms part of this cycle. One reason behind the connection may be perpetrators of domestic violence who intentionally harm animals to intimidate and gain psychological control over their victims [10]. Furthermore,

animal cruelty toward children was reported. Children exposed to domestic violence perpetrated against their mother are at increased risk of experiencing socioemotional distress that increases the chance of animal abuse [11]. Animal cruelty can serve as an indicator of domestic or aggressive criminal behaviour [12]. Pinel published the first report that linked interpersonal violence and animal cruelty back in 1806. He documented cases where both animals and humans experienced violence at their hands [13].

This study's central thesis is the belief that animal cruelty and domestic violence are inextricably interlinked, thus justifying joint investigations and efforts against both phenomena.

### **Research methodology**

To carry out this research paper, a multimethod research approach that combined qualitative and quantitative methodologies was chosen; this allowed for in-depth exploration into animal cruelty issues related to domestic violence.

As part of this investigation, a multidisciplinary approach was utilized, drawing from academic sources, empirical data analysis, legal considerations and criminological perspectives - this allowed for more thorough exploration of animal cruelty/domestic violence relationships.

As part of writing the article, a literature review was performed; that is, an analysis of academic and research papers, books, research reports and publications related to animal cruelty and domestic violence. This allowed for compiling an overview of previous studies as well as pinpointing key topics and results that stood out.

At the same time, empirical data was also compiled. To gain a fuller understanding of how cruelty to animals relates to domestic violence and vice versa, data such as surveys, expert interviews with victims as well as statistical reports were utilized - this information coming from various sources such as organizations dedicated to animal rights or combatting domestic violence.

At this research study, two methods were implemented - expert interviews and

questionnaires. Expert interviews: Interviews were held with specialists from animal rights, criminology and psychology to obtain professional opinions about and analyses of this problem. Questionnaires: A questionnaire was devised and distributed among victims of domestic violence to ascertain if cruelty to animals existed within their relationships.

The data that had been obtained were subjected to both qualitative and quantitative analyses. Statistics such as correlation analysis, multiple regression, variance analysis were employed while qualitative data analysis focused on identifying themes, common patterns, or patterns present within studied phenomena.

### **Discussion**

Results from our study demonstrate a correlation between animal cruelty and domestic violence, particularly between children who treated animals harshly and becoming aggressive or violent toward family relationships in later years [14].

Our results are in line with other studies which have also established this connection between animal cruelty and violent tendencies in individuals, which serve as early indicators for future violence in humans. [15] cited such evidence that animal cruelty could serve as an early indicator of future violent tendencies among its participants.

One explanation may lie within "transmission of violence". Children exposed to animal violence at home could interpret such violence as normal and imitate it [16]. Furthermore, animal abuse could form part of an overall cycle of aggression directed against other family members as the aggressor starts with animals first before moving onto family members themselves.

Our findings also highlight the influence of socio-economic factors in animal cruelty and domestic violence relationships. Families with lower income and limited resources tend to be more at risk from animal abuse due to higher stress and tension levels within these households; such increased tension increases violence against both animals and family members alike.

Our results have great practical significance; they demonstrate the need to

address cases of animal cruelty within families, specifically in relation to animal companions. Early identification and intervention for incidents related to animal abuse could prevent further domestic violence incidents from arising.

Cruelty to animals among children may be caused by several factors, including lack of empathy, socioemotional development disorders or relationships where cruelty exists [17]. At a macroecological level, factors like economic stress, high unemployment rates and an increase in crime rates may increase parental stress levels which then increase domestic violence rates as a consequence; simultaneously these macroecological forces could increase animal cruelty due to inability of understanding animals as individual beings [18].

Studies indicate a correlation between intimate partners who show violence against women, as well as acts of pet cruelty by these partners [19]. Rapists sometimes resort to cruel actions against pets as an intimidatory tactic and means of maintaining psychological control over their victims.

Our findings are in line with previous studies in this area and broaden our knowledge about the link between animal abuse and domestic violence, socio-economic factors and more effective prevention methods for domestic violence. Further investigation can help deepen this knowledge base further and foster more efficient ways of fighting domestic abuse.

### **Results and analysis**

Animal cruelty and domestic violence have long been recognized as major social concerns requiring both society-wide attention as well as research inquiry. Recently, several European studies have sought to better understand their correlation and find effective means of prevention.

Studies conducted overseas demonstrate a close link between animal cruelty and domestic violence. These results are of paramount significance because they help us better comprehend the dynamics and mechanisms of violence within families as well as mitigate any further negative outcomes.

Studies have demonstrated a correlation between cases of animal abuse and domestic

violence. Children and adults who abuse animals tend to engage in aggressive behaviors and violate rules, often becoming aggressive towards others themselves as a result of such abuse. Many instances of domestic violence start out with cruelty against animals which has become recognized as an early indicator of violent tendencies.

Animal cruelty can serve as a method for controlling family members or partners, using animals to intimidate victims and ensure psychological submission.

Studies show that children who abuse animals at an early age are more likely to become aggressive individuals and lawbreakers in later years - an effect known as cruelty continuum which means animal abuse could serve as the precursor for violence against other humans.

Bright and colleagues conducted an analysis using data gleaned from surveying 81,000 juvenile aggressors; from this survey it was discovered that 466 (or 0.6% of total sample) engaged in acts of cruelty towards animals, and 37.6% confessing their crime had committed their first offence before reaching 12 years old. This result was consistent with previous research which indicates 76-88% cases of domestic cruelty toward animals were also linked with instances of violence against children [20].

Prevalence rates of cruelty towards animals among children vary across nations and have yet to be studied in detail in many of them. Campbell found that 53% of cases involving cruelty towards pets were committed by adults while 20% involved children (aged six or under). A study conducted in Italy by Baldry revealed 50% involvement among adolescents while 21% participation among Australian teenagers [21]. Research into what leads children to commit such acts against animals remains relevant since it can identify situations which foster violent acts against these creatures.

Studies conducted on children found that 16.2% have hurt an animal at least once and revealed that cruelty or callousness (such as lack of empathy), coupled with having low empathy levels are predictors for child animal abuse.

Studies conducted underlined the significance of understanding the connection

between animal abuse and domestic violence – specifically within children and adolescents' context – and domestic abuse or assault; the latter can have serious sociocultural and psychological ramifications for both victims of domestic abuse as well as perpetrators themselves.

Such studies enable us to identify risks and factors which might contribute to violent behavior among children in the future, including low levels of empathy and callousness identified by Hartman and co-authors as predictors for animal cruelty by children. As a result, preventive measures, and educational work with younger generations regarding interactions with animals as well as understandings regarding empathy are vitally important.

Fighting animal cruelty can have an immediate and long-term effect on domestic violence levels. Preventing and detecting cases of cruelty to animals as well as teaching children empathy skills are proven ways of decreasing domestic violence risk and contributing to more harmonious, nonviolent relationships within society. Such efforts not only benefit animals themselves but can contribute significantly towards creating peaceful societies as a whole.

Combatting animal cruelty can help combat domestic violence. Society-building, tightened legislation and providing victims of both animal and domestic abuse with support are crucial steps towards solving this problem.

Successful prevention of animal cruelty crimes depends on effective detection and unforgivable punishment of those responsible. Otherwise, we often witness repeat offenders involved with this activity taking part. If this requirement isn't fulfilled, criminal acts often recur, often with new participants joining them as perpetrators of animal abuse crimes.

Based on research performed, several conclusions can be reached as a result:

- Studies of animal cruelty offer an effective means for understanding its nature, causes and potential solutions to create more efficient strategies against its commission.

- Given the unique aspects of animal cruelty crime identified through criminological analysis, prevention is paramount in stopping such acts of abuse against them. Numerous

measures have been developed and proposed as part of such prevention measures; one key element involves actively shaping young minds with socially acceptable views regarding animal relations.

Animal abuse and domestic violence go hand-in-hand, underscoring the necessity for long-term strategies to stop both forms of violation in society, legislation, and animal welfare organizations collaborating together on creating effective measures against both types of violations.

Domestic violence prevention efforts may benefit from greater efforts against animal cruelty. Understanding their relationship allows us to devise more efficient intervention and prevention strategies.

One key measure involves informing and educating society on the dangers associated with cruelty towards animals and domestic violence, and their connection. This will increase awareness and allow for quicker detection of cases.

Additionally, joint programs between animal protection services and domestic violence services should be created for more effective assessment and intervention in family situations where both animals and family members have been victims of mistreatment.

### **Conclusion**

Scientific investigation on the relationship between animal cruelty and domestic violence has illuminated its significance for contemporary society. We explored its various facets, analyzed results of many studies conducted, and came up with significant conclusions which can serve as the foundation of further studies and practical actions taken against it.

At first, our research demonstrated a close link between animal cruelty and domestic violence. This relationship becomes even clearer when children commit acts of animal cruelty against other children - often beginning their path of violence by harming animals first - eventually becoming violent towards people themselves.

Second, our study demonstrated the significance of preventive measures and educational work focused on building empathy and care for animals among children

and adolescents. A higher level of empathy correlates to less violent acts being committed against living beings; this in turn plays an essential part in creating healthier societies without violence.

Prevention of cruelty against animals and domestic violence requires an integrative effort at both public and legal levels. Here are a few measures which could assist with solving such problems: Public measures include:

- Education and Awareness: Educational campaigns regarding animal rights and consequences of cruelty must take place among the population as soon as possible, beginning at an early age with empathy-building lessons for animals and caring for them from a child onward.

- Psychological Support: Ensuring psychological support for children and families experiencing violence. This allows children and adults to discuss their concerns openly as well as find better strategies to deal with stressful situations.

- Foster a Culture of Nonviolence in Public: Establish an antiviolence environment through media coverage and school programs, condemning acts of violence against animals as well as cruelty towards them.

- Development of social services: These include services that offer assistance for families experiencing difficulty, including providing care to both children and animals.

At the same time, legal measures deserve extra consideration:

- Tougher Laws: Tighter laws regarding animal cruelty and domestic violence will result in more severe punishment for those responsible and improved response from law enforcement agencies.

- Restricting Access to Weapons: Tightening gun controls and restricting their availability to individuals who have committed acts of violence against animals or have had history with violence against other humans.

- Creation of a Reporting System: Implement a reporting system for cases of animal abuse and domestic violence to quickly react and warn about incidents as soon as they arise.

- Victim Protection: Ensuring the rights and protecting victims of violence - including animals. This may require setting up shelters

and assistance centers specifically to aid these individuals.

Social and legal measures must work hand-in-hand to create an environment in which animals, family members, and visitors to our society can live securely without fear.

Finally, our findings emphasize the necessity for further investigation in this area – specifically across countries and cultures – so as to better comprehend animal cruelty's characteristics and causes as well

as its correlation with domestic violence; this would enable us to devise more efficient means for combatting violence among youth while simultaneously building empathy.

Overall, our study illuminates the relevance and significance of animal cruelty issues as they relate to domestic violence. Animal welfare should receive priority consideration in creating an equitable society where all its members, including animals, feel safe.

## References

1. European Convention for the protection of pet animals No. 29470, Strasbourg, 13 November 1987. [Electronic resource] – URL: <https://treaties.un.org/doc/Publication/UNTS/Volume%201704/volume-1704-I-29470-English.pdf> (accessed: 11.08.2023).
2. The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Responsible Treatment of Animals" No. 97-VII, 30 December, [Electronic resource] – URL: <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z2100000097> (accessed: 16.08.2023).
3. Chuchayev A. Commentary on the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. - Moscow: "Contract", 2013. – 672 p.
4. Shannon T. Grugan. The Companions We Keep: A Situational Analysis and Proposed Typology of Companion Animal Cruelty Offenses // *Deviant Behavior*. – 2018. – Vol. 396. – P. 790-806. DOI: 10.1080/01639625.2017.1335513.
5. Burchfield, K.B. The nature of animal crime: Scope and severity in Chicago. *Crime Delinq.* – 2018. – Vol. 64. – P. 1904-1924. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128717719515>.
6. Ascione F.R. Children who are cruel to animals: A review of research and implications for developmental psychopathology // *Anthrozoos*. – 1993. – Vol. 6. – P. 226-247. DOI: 10.2752/089279393787002105.
7. Chan H.C., Wong R.W.Y. Childhood and adolescent animal cruelty and subsequent interpersonal violence in adulthood: A review of the literature // *Aggress. Violent Behav.* – 2019. – Vol. 48. – P. 83-93. DOI: 10.1016/j.avb.2019.08.007.
8. World Health Organization (WHO) World Report on Violence and Health: Summary. [Electronic resource] – URL: [https://www.who.int/violence\\_injury\\_prevention/violence/world\\_report/en/summary\\_en.pdf](https://www.who.int/violence_injury_prevention/violence/world_report/en/summary_en.pdf) (accessed: 20.08.2023).
9. Gallagher B., Allen M., Jones B. Animal abuse and intimate partner violence: Researching the link and its significance in Ireland – A veterinary perspective // *Ir. Vet. J.* – 2008. – Vol. 61. – P. 658. DOI: 10.1186/2046-0481-61-10-658.
10. McDonald S.E., Collins E.A., Nicotera N., Hageman T.O., Ascione F.R., Williams J.H., Graham-Bermann S.A. Children's experiences of companion animal maltreatment in households characterized by intimate partner violence // *Child Abuse Negl.* – 2015. – Vol. 50. – P. 116-127. DOI: 10.1016/j.chiabu.2015.10.005.
11. McDonald S.E., Collins E.A., Maternick A., Nicotera N., Graham-Bermann S., Ascione F.R., Williams J.H. Intimate partner violence survivors' reports of their children's exposure to companion animal maltreatment: A qualitative study // *J. Interpers. Violence*. – 2019. – Vol. 34. – P. 2627-2652. DOI: 10.1177/0886260516689775.
12. Monsalve S., Pereira É.L., Leite L.O., Polo G., Garcia R. Perception, knowledge and attitudes of small animal practitioners regarding animal abuse and interpersonal violence in Brazil and Colombia // *Res. Vet. Sci.* – 2019. – Vol. 124. – P. 61-69. DOI: 10.1016/j.rvsc.2019.03.002.
13. Pinel P. A treatise on Insanity. Messers Cadell & Davies, Strand; – London, UK: 1806, 1-213 pp.
14. Carlisle-Frank P., Frank J.M., Nielsen L. Selective battering of the family pet. // *Anthrozoös*. – 2004. – Vol. 17. – P. 26-42. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.2752/089279304786991864>.
15. Flynn C.P. Examining the links between animal abuse and human violence // *Crime Law Soc. Chang.* – 2011. – Vol. 55. – P. 453-468.
16. Newberry M. Pets in danger: Exploring the link between domestic violence and animal abuse // *Aggress. Violent Behav.* – 2017. – Vol. 34. – P. 273-281. DOI: 10.1016/j.avb.2016.11.007.

17. Leary T., Southard L., Hill J., Ashman J. The MacDonald Triad revisited: An empirical assessment of relationships between triadic elements and parental abuse in serial killers. *N. Am. J. Psychol.* – 2017. – Vol. 19. – P. 627-640.
18. Richard C., Reese L.A. The interpersonal context of human/nonhuman animal violence // *Anthrozoös.* – 2019. – Vol. 32. – P. 65-87. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/08927936.2019.1550282>.
19. Travers C., Dixon A., Thorne K., Spicer K. Cruelty towards the family pet: A survey of women experiencing domestic violence on the Central Coast // *New South Wales. Med. J. Aust.* – 2009. – Vol. 191. – P. 409-410. DOI: [10.5694/j.1326-5377.2009.tb02855.x](https://doi.org/10.5694/j.1326-5377.2009.tb02855.x).
20. Bright M.A., Huq M.S., Spencer T., Applebaum J.W., Hardt N. Animal cruelty as an indicator of family trauma: Using adverse childhood experiences to look beyond child abuse and domestic violence // *Child Abuse Negl.* – 2018. – Vol. 76. – P. 287-296. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chiabu.2017.11.011>.
21. Campbell A.M. The intertwined well-being of children and non-human animals: An analysis of animal control reports involving children // *Soc. Sci.* – 2022. – Vol. 11. – P. 46. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci11020046>.

**А.Ж. Муратова<sup>1</sup>, А.Б. Сманова<sup>1</sup>, Е.К. Даурембеков<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Ал-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан

<sup>2</sup>Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Астана, Қазақстан

### **Жануарларға қатыгездік тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылықтың көрсеткіші ретінде**

**Аңдатпа.** Жануарларға қатыгездік – бұл денсаулық сақтаудың өсіп келе жатқан проблемасы және тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылықтың ерте көрсеткіші, сондықтан бұл ғылыми мақалада оның тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылықпен байланысы зерттелген.

Бұл зерттеу жануарларға қатыгездік пен тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылық, әсіресе үй жануарларына қатысты әрекеттер мен жануарлар үй жағдайында агрессияға ұшыраған кезде құрбандардың бастамасымен мал шаруашылығы жағдайлары арасындағы байланысты орнатуға және зерттеуге бағытталған. Авторлар мал шаруашылығының психологиялық, әлеуметтік-мәдени, құқықтық аспектілерін, сондай-ақ үй жануарларының өздері үйдегі агрессияның объектісіне айналу жағдайларын зерттеді.

Зерттеу нәтижелері құқық қорғау органдарына, қоғамдық ұйымдарға және әлеуметтік қолдау мен психологияда жұмыс істейтін мамандарға істерді тезірек анықтауға көмектесетін жануарларға қатыгездік пен тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылық арасындағы күтпеген байланысты көрсетеді. Бұл сонымен қатар зардап шеккендерге жедел көмек алуға мүмкіндік береді. Бұл зерттеу құқық қорғау органдарының қызметкерлері үшін, сондай-ақ әлеуметтік қолдау мен психологияның осы салаларында жұмыс істейтін тәжірибешілер үшін үлкен маңызға ие.

Құқық қорғау органдары, әлеуметтік қызметтер және қоғамдық ұйымдар осы зерттеудің нәтижелерін тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылықты анықтау, сондай-ақ жануарларды қатыгездіктен қорғау процедураларын жетілдіру үшін пайдалана алады.

**Түйін сөздер:** жануарлар, қатыгездік, жануарларды қорғау, зорлық-зомбылық, жануарларға қатыгездік, тұрмыстық зорлық-зомбылық, жануарлар құқығын қорғау қызметі.

**А.Ж. Муратова<sup>1</sup>, А.Б. Сманова<sup>1</sup>, Е.К. Даурембеков<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Казахский национальный университет имени аль-Фараби, Алматы, Казахстан,

<sup>2</sup>Евразийский национальный университет им. Л.Н. Гумилева, Астана, Казахстан

### **Жестокое обращение с животными как показатель бытового насилия**

**Аннотация.** Жестокое обращение с животными является растущей проблемой общественного здравоохранения и ранним показателем домашнего насилия, поэтому в данной научной статье исследуется его связь с домашним насилием.

Это исследование направлено на установление и изучение связи между жестоким обращением с животными и насилием в семье, особенно актами, совершаемыми в отношении домашних питомцев, и случаями ведения животноводства по инициативе жертв, когда животные становятся объектами

агрессии в домашней обстановке. Авторы исследовали психологические, социокультурные, юридические аспекты животноводства, а также случаи, когда домашние животные сами становятся объектами агрессии в домашних условиях.

Результаты исследования выявляют неожиданную связь между жестоким обращением с животными и насилием в семье, которая могла бы помочь правоохранительным органам, общественным организациям и специалистам, работающим в области социальной поддержки и психологии, быстрее выявлять случаи. Это также позволило бы жертвам получить немедленную помощь. Это исследование имеет большое значение для сотрудников правоохранительных органов, а также практиков, работающих в этих областях социальной поддержки и психологии.

Правоохранительные органы, социальные службы и общественные организации могут использовать результаты этого исследования для совершенствования процедур выявления бытового насилия, а также защиты животных от жестокого обращения.

**Ключевые слова:** животные, жестокое обращение, защита животных, насилие, жестокое обращение с животными, домашнее насилие, служба защиты прав животных.

### **Information about authors:**

*Muratova A.Zh.* – PhD student, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan.

*Smanova A.B.* – Candidate of Law, Senior Lecturer, Department of Theory and History of State and Law, Constitutional and Administrative Law, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Kazakhstan.

*Daurembekov Ye.K.* – PhD, Senior Lecturer, Department of Criminal Law Disciplines, L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Astana, Kazakhstan.

*Муратова А. Ж.* – заң факультетінің 3 курс докторанты, әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан.

*Сманова А.Б.* – з.ғ.к., заң факультетінің мемлекет және құқық теориясы мен тарихы, конституциялық және әкімшілік құқық кафедрасының аға оқытушысы, әл-Фараби атындағы Қазақ ұлттық университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан.

*Даурембеков Е.К.* – PhD, қылмыстық-құқықтық пәндер кафедрасының аға оқытушысы, Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Астана, Қазақстан.